Will China be the Next Pole of Attraction of Global Talent?

Huiyao (Henry) Wang

President & Founder
Center for China and Globalization (CCG)
Feb. 2021, Beijing
1. International Talents in and out of China

2. Recent Developments in China’s Immigration Policies to Attract International Talents

3. Influence of the COVID-19 Pandemic: Changes in International Talent Mobility

4. Policy Recommendations
International talents in and out of China

- Defining international talents
- International migrants: General trends and regional distribution
- The mobility of international students
Definition of Talents

“Internationalized talent” shall be imbued with global vision, well-versed in international rules and capable of participating in international affairs and competition.

Three categories:

01 **Foreign professionals**: move to China primarily for employment, business or entrepreneurship, e.g. transnational corporations expatriates, foreign investors and scholars at Chinese universities.

02 **International students and youth talent**: potential intellectual capital as China is becoming an increasingly popular destination for international education.

03 **Chinese returnees**: the international knowledge and experiences of the Chinese graduates who completed their studies overseas are valuable assets for the development of the country.
By 2019, with more than **10.73 million** emigrants mainland China had become the 3rd largest emigration country that ranks only after India and Mexico.

Most of the Chinese emigrants are **international talents**, including high-skilled workers, multinational executives, international students, etc.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Region</th>
<th>2010</th>
<th>2015</th>
<th>2010-2015 Growth Rate</th>
<th>2015-2019 Growth Rate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Asia</td>
<td>4633423</td>
<td>4974216</td>
<td>7.36%</td>
<td>0.16%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>North America</td>
<td>2535293</td>
<td>3319978</td>
<td>30.95%</td>
<td>8.09%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Europe</td>
<td>955128</td>
<td>1063228</td>
<td>11.32%</td>
<td>13.34%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oceania</td>
<td>464616</td>
<td>609887</td>
<td>31.27%</td>
<td>22.22%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Latin America &amp; the Caribbean</td>
<td>101348</td>
<td>132556</td>
<td>30.79%</td>
<td>7.54%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Africa</td>
<td>43434</td>
<td>61794</td>
<td>42.27%</td>
<td>10.58%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Stock</td>
<td>8733242</td>
<td>10161659</td>
<td>16.37%</td>
<td>5.62%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

From 2015 to 2019, the growth rate for the migration outflow to Asia and North America both significantly declined. Europe is the only region that has witnessed an increase in the growth rate.

Source: UN DESA
## Chinese Emigrants in the World: Regional Distribution

### Stock of Chinese Migrants in the Top 20 Countries of Destination in 2015 and 2019

Source: collected and calculated from UNDESA data

- Among the top 20 destinations, **13 developed countries attracted 6.31 million (58.84%) Chinese emigrants.**
- The migration stock to top 4 countries continued to increase in the past years.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ranking in 2019</th>
<th>Country</th>
<th>2015</th>
<th>2019</th>
<th>Growth Rate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>United States</td>
<td>2676697</td>
<td>2899267</td>
<td>8.32%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Japan</td>
<td>714570</td>
<td>784763</td>
<td>9.82%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Canada</td>
<td>645278</td>
<td>691489</td>
<td>7.16%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Australia</td>
<td>508870 (5)</td>
<td>641624</td>
<td><strong>26.09%</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>South Korea</td>
<td>609332 (4)</td>
<td>620295</td>
<td>1.80%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Singapore</td>
<td>448566</td>
<td>380145</td>
<td>-15.25%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Italy</td>
<td>200372</td>
<td>228231</td>
<td>13.90%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>United Kingdom</td>
<td>198472</td>
<td>225385</td>
<td>13.56%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Bangladesh</td>
<td>162772</td>
<td>164917</td>
<td>1.32%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Spain</td>
<td>155713</td>
<td>164695</td>
<td>5.77%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ranking in 2019</th>
<th>Country</th>
<th>2015</th>
<th>2019</th>
<th>Growth Rate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>France</td>
<td>114475</td>
<td>121172</td>
<td>5.85%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Germany</td>
<td>86291 (14)</td>
<td>119093</td>
<td>38.01%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>India</td>
<td>110098 (12)</td>
<td>108286</td>
<td>-1.65%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>New Zealand</td>
<td>92602 (13)</td>
<td>95185</td>
<td>2.79%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Thailand</td>
<td>74411</td>
<td>77581</td>
<td>4.26%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>Indonesia</td>
<td>72302</td>
<td>75511</td>
<td>4.44%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>Netherlands</td>
<td>62708</td>
<td>70830</td>
<td>12.95%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>Russia</td>
<td>56171</td>
<td>56157</td>
<td>-0.02%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>South Africa</td>
<td>36583</td>
<td>41004</td>
<td>12.08%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>Philippines</td>
<td>35952</td>
<td>37083</td>
<td>3.15%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Among the top 20 destinations, **13 developed countries attracted 6.31 million (58.84%) Chinese emigrants.**
- The migration stock to top 4 countries continued to increase in the past years.
The permanent residency obtained through employment-based preferences experienced a sharp decline to 18843 in 2018, which was less than 60% of the number in 2016. The number of Chinese citizens receiving approvals for EB-1 Permanent Workers – Extraordinary Ability/Outstanding Professor/Multinational Executive also plunged in 2019.
In 2019, mainland China received approximately **1.03 million immigrants**, including **284.8 thousand from Hong Kong SAR** and **25.7 thousand from Macau SAR**. Among the 18 identified major countries of origin, **10 of them are involved in the Belt and Road Initiative (BRI)**. **Countries which have established extensive economic partnerships** with China are becoming the most important origin countries of China’s international immigrants.
In the 10 years from 2004, when China introduced its “permanent residence permit” system, to 2013, 7,356 foreigners were granted China’s permanent residency.

In 2016, the Ministry of Public Security approved 1,576 foreigners to reside permanently in China, bringing the number of Chinese “green card” holders to more than 10,000.

12 exit-entry policies to support the construction of Shanghai as a Science and Technology Innovation Center

20 new Exit-Entry policies to support the Innovation and Development of Beijing

• 10 Exit-Entry policies to support the construction of Fujian Free Trade Zone,
• 16 Exit-Entry Provisions for Supporting the Construction and Innovation-Driven Development in Guangdong Free Trade Zone

Shanghai: July 1, 2015

Beijing: March 1, 2016

Fujian and Guangdong: April and July, 2016

10 Measures on Exit and Entry Administration, to facilitate foreign Chinese living and working in China, encourage foreign investors to apply for permanent residency and foreign students to innovate and start business in Shanghai
Primarily issued to high-end foreign talents who are in extreme demand for China’s economic and social development, including highly qualified scientists, international entrepreneurs and other foreign nationals who possess specific high-level skills.

China sent a clear message that it welcomes top foreign talent and is willing to create a conducive environment for skilled professionals from all over the world to both work and live comfortably in China.
Student Mobility: Chinese Students Studying Overseas

The Number and the Growth Rate of Chinese Students Studying Abroad between 2014 and 2019

Chinese students moving abroad to pursue foreign degrees consisted an important group of Chinese emigrants.

According to the Ministry of Education, the number of overseas Chinese students has sustained a continuous high growth since 2009.

In 2019,

- 703.5 thousand Chinese Students Overseas
- 6.25% Annual Growth Rate

Source: Ministry of Education, China
## Student Mobility: Chinese Students Studying Overseas

### Top 10 Countries for Chinese Students in Tertiary Education (2019)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Rank of China as country of origin</th>
<th>Students from China (in ten thousands)</th>
<th>% of Chinese students</th>
<th>2018-2019 growth rate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Japan</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>8.64</td>
<td>41.38</td>
<td>-0.82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Australia</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>15.38</td>
<td>36.58</td>
<td>0.25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>United States</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>36.95</td>
<td>33.74</td>
<td>0.56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Zealand</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2.00</td>
<td>32.70</td>
<td>1.92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Canada</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>9.62</td>
<td>22.09</td>
<td>-15.81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>United Kingdom</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>10.92</td>
<td>21.99</td>
<td>1.69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Germany</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3.69</td>
<td>13.09</td>
<td>-0.09</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Russia</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3.00</td>
<td>8.95</td>
<td>0.29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>France</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3.01</td>
<td>8.76</td>
<td>-0.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finland</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0.22</td>
<td>6.87</td>
<td>-0.27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sweden</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0.26</td>
<td>6.80</td>
<td>0.11</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: IIE, Project Atlas

In general, the percentage of international students from China in major receiving countries remained steady compared to 2018.

Noticeably, the preferences for destinations among Chinese students have been diversifying over the years, and their choices are heavily impacted by the bilateral relations (e.g. Canada) and immigration policies (e.g. U.S.) in the receiving countries.
As a group of highly-educated personnel with global vision, international students are perceived as a potential and important part of global talents.

Studying abroad has become a mainstream choice for the graduates from the most prestigious schools in China.

Since 2017 the growth rate of the number of students studying in the United States has slowed down Trump administration's restrictive immigration policies, particularly for the STEM subjects.
China has been one of the countries suffering from severe brain drain. In recent years, the vigorously growing economy and its successful integration with the world economy has created more favorable conditions to bring back those educated talents and reverse the brain drain.
Student Mobility: Chinese Returnees and the Brain Circulation

The Country/region that U10 Graduates Found Their First Job (2014-2018)

Although 70% of U10 graduates prefer to complete their further studies abroad, more than 80% returned and found their first job in China, showing a “study abroad–return to work” talent circulation.

The knowledge and skills acquired through international education and multi-cultural experiences would facilitate China’s transition into a knowledge economy.

Source: LinkedIn
As China is becoming an increasingly popular destination, the number of international students maintained a successive growth over the years.

The development experience of traditional immigrant-receiving countries showed that international students have enormous potential in the intellectual capital which could be utilized for host country’s future economic development.

According to a survey on international students’ employment preferences in 2018, 62.32% of the students have expressed explicit intention to work in China after graduation.
Recent Developments in Immigration Policies to Attract Talents

- Immigration Administration System
- National Immigration and International Talent Policies
- Local International Talent Policies
Immigration Administration System

Upgrade to multi-dimensional and systematic administration

"A relatively well-founded immigration administration environment is the prerequisite to ensure the safety and development of immigrants in the host country."

Establishment of National Immigration Administration (NIA)

The first national-level agency dedicated to immigration-related issues including permanent residency, border control, migrant integration, immigrant services, etc.

Explorations in the immigration legal system

To form a legally-encoded immigration system, the NIA tried to incorporate social services and consult professional expertise for legislative interpretations.

Integrate immigration policies with China’s national development strategies

The reform of China’s permanent residency system and make it more accessible to certain groups of highly-skilled and highly-educated professionals.
Immigration Administration System

Shift in administration orientation from “exerting control” to “delivering services”

The previous regulatory framework has been outdated and needs the upgrade to a more inclusive and integrated approach focusing on effective services and equal treatment.

Aims to mobilize resources and social forces and facilitate immigration integration, the NIA initiated the Immigration Service Center (ISC) to provide a full range of services including language, culture, and policy affairs.
Immigration Administration System

Technological innovation driving the intelligent upgrade of immigration administration

Modern information technologies such as cloud computing and big data was applied in constructing the entry-exit document identity authentication platform.

The expanded application of self-service customs clearance equipment, and face recognition technology to improve the efficiency of port clearance.

The collection of biological information, interconnected networks with government service platforms and immigration system helped the tracking and security management in localities.
National Immigration and International Talent Policies

Opening-up in Permanent Residence Policies

2016
The Opinions on Deepening the Reform of the Talent Development System and Mechanism, the Central Government of China
The Opinions on Strengthening the Administration of Foreigners’ Permanent Residence Services, the State Council of China

2020
The Regulations on the Administration of Permanent Residence of Foreigners in People’s Republic of China (Draft for Solicitation of Comments), the Ministry of Justice, China

2015
12 entry-exit policies and measures supporting the construction of Shanghai as a Science and Technology Innovation Center, Ministry of Public Security, China

2017
The Notice on Permitting Outstanding Foreign College Graduates to Obtain Employment in China, the Ministry of Foreign Affairs & the Ministry of Education, China

2020
Deepen International Cooperation and further up on education to nurture more high-level professionals with global perspective, the Ministry of Education

Policy Breakthroughs for International Students to Intern and Work in China
Local International Talent Policies

Local Talent Attraction Policies and Programs

**Chengdu**
"Tianfu Talent Plan": entitling talents to government subsidies, household registration and the eligibility to purchase a house

**Jiangsu**
Provide grants for business activities and policy support in transforming technological achievements into commercial production

**Wuhan**
"3351 Talent Plan": creating high-tech innovation zone and recruiting top international talents and postgraduate students

**Yiwu**
Issued Foreign Citizen Card, an equivalent of local ID card to foreign residents and provide equal social services
Construction and Development of Local International Talent Communities

International talent communities were designated residential and entrepreneurial hubs for specific groups of talents. It is characterized by advanced infrastructures and social services, diverse and inclusive cultural environment as well as policy support for innovation and entrepreneurship.

Beijing

To facilitate the employment & entrepreneurship of international talents, several international talent communities were initiated to offer residency and infrastructure.

Shanghai

Highlighting an integrated and diversified atmosphere of the Zhangjiang Science City and creating a livable environment for immigrants; offering various forms of residential rental services such as talent apartments and international talent communities.
Construction and Development of Local International Talent Communities

**Chengdu**

By 2022, four types of international talent communities will be constructed to covering a variety of services in daily life and entrepreneurial development.

- Industrial Service
- Business-travel
- Culture & Education
- Residence and Life

With the construction started in October 2020, the international talent communities includes service stations that provides foreign talents assistance in visa, local registration, accommodation and employment & entrepreneurship, as well as platforms for cultural exchange and community governance.

**Guangzhou**

By 2022, four types of international talent communities will be constructed to covering a variety of services in daily life and entrepreneurial development.
Part 3: Influence of the Covid-19 Pandemic

- Increasing challenges in talent attraction
- New patterns of international talent mobility
Increasing Challenges in Talent Attraction

Foreign talents in China
The impact of the travel restrictions due to the pandemic on talent mobility is relatively high.
- foreigners were unable to return to China
- Many physical activities such as face-to-face teaching, ceremonies, research activities and PhD exchange programs were cancelled.

Overseas Chinese talents
Overseas:
- Expiration of legal status & high living expenses
- Racial discrimination and hate crimes against Asians
Return to China: travel restrictions of “Five Ones” led to frequent cancellation of flights
New Patterns of International Talent Mobility

**Current challenges**
Physical mobility of the talents cannot be resumed during the pandemic

The frequency of online intellectual mobility has been increased
Zoom: average number of daily users increased from 10 million in December 2019 to 200 million in March 2020

**Alternative solution**
Online mobility may off-set the negative impacts cased by the stagnation in talent exchange and mobility due to the pandemic

Remote working, or work from home (WFH), has become a new normal.

New patterns:
Online learning, lab-sharing, virtual webinar and conference that could enable long-distance study, research and communications, which brings convenience to the international talent mobility.
Integrate social services and documentation approvals with smartphone applications to reduce face-to-face interactions and improve efficiency.

Achievements in maintaining talent exchange online with technology

Chinese Universities and research institutes were among the firsts that adapted to the new modes of teaching and learning with upgraded online platforms.

Accelerations in developing digital products: including communication platforms to maintain remote interactions & knowledge distribution and big data applications for health status tracking and analysis.

EURAXESS survey showed that as of March 6 2020, close to 80% of the foreign staff reported that they either had implemented new online tools or were working on implementing other new alternatives.
Policy Recommendations

- Reform the immigration administration system
- Foster innovative industries and talent agglomerations
- Upgrade international talent services at sub-national level
- Harness digital technologies to explore new pathways
- Integration with the global migration governance system
- Facilitate Global Talent Flow through International Cooperation
Reform the Immigration Administration System

Reforming the previously fragmented immigration administration shared among various apparatus and establishing a comprehensive coordination system from the central to local.

More efforts should be made to bridge the gap between immigration policies and public recognition of immigrants, helping the public to better understand immigrants’ contributions, relieve their concerns about domestic job opportunities and social welfare, creating an immigrant-inclusive atmosphere for social integration.

Foster Innovative Industries and Talent Agglomerations as Engines for Regional Growth

Establish talent agglomerations devoted to advanced industries or sectors (Such as high-tech parks, innovations zones and financial headquarters), to provide sufficient employment opportunities for high-skilled talents.

The subnational governments need to be an active agency in developing infrastructure and facilities, building market access and fostering links between industries and universities/research institutes.
Upgrade International Talent Services at the Sub-national Level

The local governments need to adopt more flexible talent settlement policies and invest resources into public services ranging from healthcare, education, transportation infrastructures, etc.

Establish talent service centers that equipped with professionally-trained staff and provide multiple services such as policy and legal consultation, assistance in various documentations, visa and residence application processing, Chinese language and culture classes, as well as community integration activities.
Harness Digital Technologies to Explore New Pathways for Talent Attraction and to Enable Talent Exchange and Cooperation

Chinese enterprises, especially those associated with international businesses, should provide the option to work remotely, to access a larger pool of talents on a global scale.

Establish a digitalized and “non-touch” immigration system would be an essential governance infrastructure to handle the inflow and outflow of international talents, such as a user-friendly online platform that process visa and residency applications.

Promote the Integration with the Global Migration Governance System

Learning from the experience of traditional immigration countries, to compensate China’s lack of experience in immigration governance.

Meanwhile, joining in international institutions and international consensus regarding international migration, to show China’s commitment to globalization.

Regional agenda in labor migration and border security could be built on existing cooperation networks such as the Belt and Road Initiative.
Facilitate Global Talent Flow through International Cooperation

Incorporate relevant stakeholders, including international organizations, national government agencies, research institutes, think tanks and the civil society, to establish an international cooperation mechanism.

- Promote joint efforts to facilitate global talent flow, especially those from the countries or regions that are the main origins/destinations of global talents;
- Looking into the future, advance global talent cooperation research in high-tech fields, such as artificial intelligence, big data, automatic drive, etc.
The Center for China and Globalization (CCG) is a leading Chinese non-government think tank based in Beijing. It is dedicated to the study of Chinese public policy and globalization. Boasting a strong research team, it enjoys an impressive record of publications and events with broad public policy impact. CCG’s research agenda centers on China’s growing role in the world, drawing from issues of global governance, global trade and investment, global migration, international relations, and other topics pertaining to regional and global development.

**CCG’s Migration Center**

CCG has greatly advanced the development of migration study and policies in China. To “Explore Scientific, Open, Innovative Immigration Governance and Promote an Inclusive and Prosperous World”, CCG’s Migration Research Center holds an annual conference on Global Talent Mobility and Global Migration, and has published several reports including the *Annual Report on China’s International Migration*, *State Immigration Administration: Building an International Competitive Immigration Management and Service System* etc.

Focusing on global migration and international talent studies, it has also established cooperative relationships with many renowned international organizations, including the International Organization for Migration (IOM), the International Labor Organization (ILO), the Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD), the International Metropolis, etc. CCG has been publishing the Chinese edition of IOM’s World Migration Report since 2015. It also played a constructive role in the establishment of China’s new National Immigration Administration (NIA).
Published Bluebooks about International Talents
THANK YOU