Beyond the points test: The adaption of Australian skilled immigration policy to notions of hard and soft skill

Presentation to CERC Migration 2021 Conference, February 2021

Anna Boucher
Department of Government and International Relations

Chris F Wright
Discipline of Work and Organisational Studies
Introduction

• Immigration policies in many countries increasingly focus on skill-based selection
• Migration studies scholarship offers limited engagement with or scrutiny of concepts relating to “skill”
• We utilise critical assessments of “skill” within industrial relations and management scholarship to address the following question:

  To what extent are soft skills a selection criteria in skilled immigration selection policies traditionally focused on ‘hard’ skills?

• Why Australia? Australia as an ‘exemplary’ case where immigration selection policy has traditionally focused on “hard” skills, e.g. education, qualifications, language skills, professional training but is changing.
What is skill?

• Skill: a broad – and increasingly hard to define – concept with both “objective and subjective properties, owing to the way in which skill is socially constructed and embedded within social and power relations” (Payne, 2017: 68)
  • ‘hard skills’: based on ‘objective’ criteria, e.g. required qualifications
  • ‘soft skills’: based on ‘subjective’ criteria, e.g. interpersonal qualities
• Emerging emphasis on soft skills associated with employers gaining greater power over defining what constitutes “skill”
• Soft skills in selection can raise potential diversity bias concerns (Boucher 2016; 2020).
The challenges of defining ‘soft skills’

• Soft skills variously defined as encompassing emotional labour, aesthetic labour, articulation work, communication, problem solving, team working, leadership, resilience, attitude, motivation, loyalty and even compliance to an employer (Bolton, 2004; Lafer, 2004; Payne, 2017)

• The wide variation of ‘soft skill’ attributes “bring together a confused morass of personal traits, attitudes, qualities and predispositions” (Grugulis, 2007: 73)

• Arguments in favour of using soft skills for employee selection:
  • important for allowing workers to utilise their qualifications or technical knowledge productively (Green et al., 1998; Mitchell & Quirk, 2005)

• Arguments against using soft skills for employee selection:
  • can be used to support and legitimise, or to challenge, gender or racial discrimination (Grugulis & Vincent, 2009; Moss & Tilly, 2006)
  • E.g. Various studies finding that employer perceives workers from certain ethnic and migrant community groups as being more / less motivated, reliable or suitable for their job on their basis of their class, gender, race and/or nationality
Soft skills and immigration selection

- Considerable research indicating that the “increasing reliance on soft skills compounds opportunity for stereotyping” (Warhurst, Tilly & Gatta, 2017: 83), which may also be true for immigration selection.

- Anderson and Ruhs caution for the need to distinguish between hard skills and soft skills equated with “attributes and characteristics that are related to employer control over the workforce” (2010: 20).

- Potential issues with soft skills and temporary and employer-sponsored visas:
  - Temporary visa holders may be willing to ‘work harder’ for a specified period to qualify for permanent residency or citizenship (Bauder, 2006).
  - Sponsorship arrangements that tie workers to their employer sponsor can increase compliance, which some studies have conceptualised as a form of soft skill (e.g. Moriarty et al., 2012).
Australia’s skilled visa intakes, 1995/96 – 2019/20

Temporary employer-sponsored (457/TSS)
Permanent employer-sponsored (ENS and others)
Permanent ‘Independent’
Applying skill theory to Australia’s permanent skilled visas

• **Skilled Independent (subclass 189 visa)**
  - Educational requirements
  - English proficiency requirement
  - Designated skilled occupation requirement
  - Expression of Interest system an additional layer of selection but doesn’t include a job offer
  - *Hard skill selection prioritised*

• **Skilled Employer Sponsored Scheme**
  - Includes Employer Nomination and Regional Skilled Migration Schemes
  - Operates like the Skilled Independent Visa with key differences
  - English competency requirement (lower than ‘proficiency’)
  - Additional requirement: ongoing job offer from nominating employer
  - Applicants can apply onshore, including temporary residents with existing employment relationships (‘person-organisation fit’ / soft skill attribute)
  - *Soft skill implicit in selection criteria*
Applying skill theory to Australia’s temporary skilled visas

- **Temporary Skills Shortage Visa**
  - Stated objective of addressing shortages of ‘hard skills’
  - No longer a guaranteed pathway to permanent residency
  - Employer sponsorship a core feature, with restrictions on an employee’s capacity to leave the employment relationship
  - A significant proportion of employers use the scheme to recruit for ‘soft skills’, e.g. effort, loyalty, teamwork, personality, values
  - *Soft skill implicit in selection criteria*

- **Global Talent Visa**
  - Visa introduced in 2019; intake since increased from 5000 to 15,000
  - Targets occupations in sectors with considerable ‘hard skill’ requirements
  - Requirement of job offer from certified “trusted employers”
  - *Main focus on hard skills but soft skill elements in selection criteria*
Conclusions

• Hard skills are often necessary but insufficient for skilled visa applicants to gain entry to Australia in most categories.

• While hard skills remain important, soft skills are often a key determinant of employer recruitment / visa selection decisions

• Some visas have allowed employers more discretion to select candidates based on prior relationships with an employee nominee, i.e. ‘person-organisation fit’ – the skilled independent category has declined in terms of intake in recent years.

• Whereas hard skills act as a threshold for which applicants need to be considered for a job, soft skills often serve as the deciding factor for who an employer recruits and therefore sponsors

• As such, soft skills can be viewed as the ‘interior’ of the selection decisions, with hard skills on the ‘exterior.’